

# REGIONAL VARIATION OF PONDEROSA PINE THE FIVE-YEAR RESULT



by Chi-Wu Wang  
Robert K. Patee

**FOREST, WILDLIFE AND RANGE  
EXPERIMENT STATION**  
Director - John H. Ehrenreich  
Associate Director - A. A. Moslemi



## REGIONAL VARIATION OF PONDEROSA PINE, THE FIVE-YEAR RESULT

Chi-Wu Wang and Robert K. Patee

### INTRODUCTION

The purpose of this experiment was to obtain basic information on regional variation in the natural population of ponderosa pine as a basis of selection for genetic improvement (Wang 1967). The wide range of among-stand and among-progeny variations in the first 5-year period indicates that substantial improvement could be expected from the first generation selection.

The region of this study includes six counties in southern Idaho, viz., Adams, Boise, Elmore, Gem, Idaho, and Valley. The materials were 271 half-sib families from 37 natural stands. Each stand was represented by 1 to 10 seed trees, selected at random from the dominant class, with the restrictions that the sample trees were no less than 61 m (200 ft) apart, and that all trees in a stand were within a 1.609 km (1-mile) radius. Their geographic sources were tabulated in Appendix 1. The 1-year and 2-year growth and their relationship with seed characteristics were analyzed (Wang and Patee 1974). The progenies were tested in four sites from 1127.8 m (3700 ft) to 1630.7 m (5350 ft) within the natural range of ponderosa pine of this region. The 12-acre plantation at each site includes 10 randomized complete blocks of all the progenies in 4-tree plots at 5 ft x 10 ft spacing.

The four sites were located at (1) Boise County, 1219.2 m (4000 ft), Idaho City, U.S. Bureau of Land Management plantation (2) Adams County, 1447.8 m (4750 ft), Boulder Creek, New Meadows, Payette National Forest plantation (3) Valley County, 1630.7 m (5350 ft), Jack's Creek, Idaho State Department of Public Lands, plantation and (4) Ada County, 1127.8 m (3700 ft), Holcomb, Boise National Forest plantation. This is a report of the 5-year progeny variations, their correlation with seed, seed-tree and seedling characteristics, and the progeny x site interaction.

---

This study was conducted in cooperation with the Idaho Department of Public Lands, U.S. Bureau of Land Management, U.S. Forest Service, and the Southern Idaho Forestry Association. It was partially supported by the McIntire-Stennis fund, and was published with approval of the Director, Forest, Wildlife and Range Experiment Station, as Contribution No. 21, University of Idaho, Moscow.

Chi-Wu Wang is a professor in the College of Forestry, Wildlife and Range Sciences, University of Idaho, Moscow, Idaho. Robert K. Patee is Regional Geneticist, Region 4, U.S. Forest Service, Ogden, Utah.

**COVER PHOTO:** This Ponderosa pine progeny test seed orchard is located at the low elevation 1127.8 m (3700 ft) Boise National Forest plantation at Holcomb.

## AMONG-STAND AND WITHIN-STAND VARIATION

The analysis of variance in the four sites showed that the among-stand and among-progeny 5-year height differences are highly significant (Table 1). The five fastest growing stands as indicated by the average 5-year height on the four sites were (a) stand no. 47, Garden Valley, BNF, 79.58 cm (31.33 inch), (b) 21 A, Hazard Creek, BLM, 79.22 cm (31.19 inch), (c) 42, Trail Creek, BNF, 77.65 cm (30.57 inch), (d) 54, Zena Creek, PNF, 76.61 cm (30.16 inch), and (e) 21 B, Scriver Creek, BLM, 75.09 cm (29.56 inch).

Table 1. Analysis of Variance of 5-year Ponderosa Pine height at four test sites.

S.O.V.	D.F.	F.	S.O.V.	D.F.	F.
SITE	3	238.62**	SITE	3	424.96**
BLOCK	36	44.57**	BLOCK	36	66.16**
STAND	36	3.75**	PROGENY	270	3.87**
SXS	108	2.84**	SXP	810	2.45**
ERROR	1296		ERROR	5906	
TOTAL	1479		TOTAL	7025	

The five slowest growing stands by four-site mean height were (a) stand no. 5, 58.83 cm (23.16 inch), (b) 50, 62.62 cm (24.65 inch), (c) 26, 62.84 cm (24.74 inch), (d) 16, 62.87 cm (24.75 inch), and (e) 18, 63.73 cm (25.09 inch).

For the analysis of within-stand variation, sample trees within each stand are divided into substands according to age at 10-year intervals. Age of parent trees is given in Appendix 2. The within-stand among-substand differences in 5-year height are not significant (Table 2). Variance components attributable to within-stand among-substand variations are mostly negligible (Table 3).

## VARIANCE COMPONENTS AND POPULATION STRUCTURE

At site 1, 48.65 percent of total variance and site 4, 58.19 percent of total variance in 5-year height were associated with stands; 25.20 percent (site 1) and 19.51 percent (site 4) of the total variance were associated with progeny families. The among-progeny differences were highly significant (Tables 2, 3).

However, the analysis of variance of 5-year progenies within each individual stand indicated that within-stand among-progeny differences were significant only in 3 to 8 of the 35 multi-progeny stands (Table 4). This was a drastic change by comparison with the 1-year and 2-year seedlings. At the 1-year stage, within-stand among-progeny differences were significant in 31 of the 35 multi-progeny stands, and at the 2-year stage the among-progeny differences were significant in 32 stands. (Table 2, Wang and Patee 1977)

At this early stage of 5-year seedling height development, a distinct pattern of population structure became evident. There was more variation among stands than there was variation among mother trees within a stand (Table 3). There was no significant difference among progenies from different age classes of trees superimposed upon the same stand by natural regeneration (Table 2). And in a relative sense, the progenies from a common stand, i.e., a small panmictic population, were essentially uniform (Table 4). Similar results were obtained from among physiographic regions and within-stand studies of loblolly pine (LaFarge 1971, Barber 1966, and Wells and Switzer 1971).

## CORRELATION WITH SEEDLING, SEED, AND SEED TREE

Partial correlation analysis of 5-year progeny height was made with 1-year seedling height, seed characteristics, and seed tree sources (Table 5). The partial correlation with 1-year seedling height was

Table 2: Analysis of variance of 5-year Ponderosa Pine Height at Each of the Four Test Sites.

S.O.V.	Site 1		Site 2		Site 3		Site 4	
	D.F.	F.	D.F.	F.	D.F.	F.	D.F.	F.
STAND	36	2.14*	36	2.47**	35	1.03	36	1.25
SUBSTAND	73	0.71	73	0.89	70	1.40	72	1.12
PROGENY	152	1.96**	158	1.85**	153	1.42**	155	1.67**
INDIVIDUAL	1875		1891		712		1462	
TOTAL	2136		2158		970		1725	

7  
110

und to be highly significant, but it was not significant  
ith seed characteristics, including seed size, seed  
eight, and germination capacity. The 5-year seedling  
eight was found to be inversely correlated with seed  
ee age, but not correlated with mother tree height.

## DISCUSSION

Theoretically speaking it is logical to infer that  
greater genetic gain can be expected from among-stand  
selection than from within-stand among-progeny  
selection. The 5-year result proved the veracity of this  
approach.

Mean height growth was used as an indication of  
vigor and general adaptability of the progeny families.  
The 5-year result indicated that this desirable character  
was not distributed at random. In the natural  
population, desirable parent trees were found to be  
concentrated in certain local populations. Of the 20  
best half-sib families, 8 families were from the best  
two stands, and 14 families from the best five stands.

Table 3. Percentage of Variance Components Attributable  
to the Variance of Progeny Mean 5-Year Height at the Four  
Test Sites.

O.V.	Site 1	Site 2	Site 3	Site 4
STAND	48.65	58.19	0	14.79
SUBSTAND	0	0	32.22	9.00
PROGENY	25.20	19.51	20.54	30.81
INDIVIDUAL	26.15	22.30	47.24	45.40
TOTAL	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00

The geographic origin of the seed trees has an  
altitudinal range of 1005.84 m (3300 ft) from stand  
No. 32 (New Meadows), 975.36 m (3200 ft), to stand  
No. 41 (Cottonwood, Boise), 1981.2 m (6500 ft), and  
altitudinal range of 200 miles from stand No. 11  
(Mountain Home) to stand No. 43 A (White Bird). The  
5-year seedling height, as that of the 2-year seedling,  
was inversely correlated with altitude and not  
significantly correlated with latitude.

The four sites for the progeny tests plantations  
were in the granitic region of average site quality. They  
were selected to represent the altitudinal range in  
which ponderosa pine was to be planted. The  
environmental influence of the test sites was reflected  
in progeny growth and the plantation means. The  
progeny site interaction of the 271 half-sib families  
was highly significant (Table 1). The plantation mean  
height of the four sites were (1) 65.76 cm (25.89  
inch), elevation 1219.2 m (4000 ft); (2) 77.95 cm  
(30.68 inch) at 1447.8 m (4750 ft); (3) 70.03 cm  
(27.57 inch) at 1630.7 m (5350 ft); and (4) 64.74 cm  
(25.49 inch) at 1127.8 m (3700 ft).

In addition to their altitudinal range, there were  
other distinct differences between the four sites. Sites  
3 and 4 were seriously affected by severe site  
condition, and site 2 by heavy snow. In view of the  
strong site influence, both the over-all performance of  
their progenies at the four sites and their site  
interaction should be taken into consideration in the  
selection of superior seed trees.

Table 4. Analysis of Variance of 5-Year Progeny Height of  
Each Stand at the Four Test Sites.

Stand	Site 1	Site 2	Site 3	Site 4
	F	F	F	F
1	2.02*	1.76	0.94	1.26
2	1.35	1.29	1.70	0.42
5	1.68	1.95	0.98	1.73
6	1.07	1.97	2.09	4.35**
9	1.74	1.65	2.14	4.10**
11	1.37	1.71	1.41	1.32
14	1.70	1.38	1.40	0.73
15	1.06	1.68	1.76	1.88
16	1.77	5.35**	0.71	1.31
17	(a)	(a)	(a)	(a)
18	1.09	1.51	2.39	1.31
19	3.14**	2.61*	1.25	1.41
20A	1.83	1.28	0.99	1.45
20B	2.67*	1.38	0.20	2.22
21A	0.98	1.28	0.72	1.70
21B	6.27**	0.09	0.26	0.81
22	0.10	0.81	0.05	0.59
23	3.62*	1.78	0.85	0.70
24	1.33	1.41	1.39	0.47
25	0.28	1.75	0.98	1.22
26	0.30	0.66	1.11	3.74*
27	1.35	1.80	5.50*	0.31
28	1.88	3.66**	1.42	0.77
29	1.25	0.41	3.92**	2.43*
35	1.35	1.58	0.66	0.96
38	2.80**	1.47	2.16	2.03
39	0.28	1.72	1.04	0.51
41	1.65	2.31*	4.85**	0.72
42	0.63	3.12*	1.56	1.00
43A	1.46	1.07	0.47	1.98
43B	2.74*	1.98	0.59	2.05
46	1.08	1.47	1.33	1.29
47	2.44*	2.30*	2.67	0.56
50	2.43	0.15	1.96	0.91
51	(b)	(b)	(b)	(b)
53	2.17	0.73	0.27	1.42
54	1.58	1.05	1.47	2.70*

(a) Bulked seed

(b) 1-tree stand

The best progenies and their stand origin are: (a) Stand No. 47, (progeny 244, 246, 250, 251), (b) 21A (112, 113, 114, 132), (c) 42 (215, 216), (d) 54 (265, 266, 270), and (e) 21B (166).

The slow growing progenies showed a similar pattern. Of the 20 worst progeny families of the four sites, 8 families were from the four most slow-growing stands. The worst progenies and their stand origin are: (a) Stand No. 5 (progeny 21, 25, 27), (b) 26 (143, 144), (c) 16 (73), and (d) 1 (1, 8). Stand and family means at the four sites are tabulated in Appendix 2.

**Table 5. Partial correlation of 2-year and 5-year height with 1-year height, seed characteristics and seed tree sources.**

	2-Year Height	5-Year
1-Year Height	0.31506**	0.25474**
Seed Length	0.00242	-0.10032
Seed Width	-0.01728	-0.00421
Seed Weight	0.07948	0.09689
Germination Capacity	0.39600**	0.07548
Mother Height	-0.03273	0.03554
Mother Age	-0.02204	-0.16825**
Altitude	-0.24874**	-0.16905**
Latitude	0.06736	0.00005
Multiple Correlation Coefficient	0.67496**	0.48464**

From the practical point of view, natural stands are better units for initial field selection than individual trees, especially in the case of ponderosa pine, which generally regenerates in group-wise pattern and mostly in site conditions of great topographic diversity. The naturally regenerated stand is in fact a natural progeny test stand of nearby seed sources. Furthermore, the seed trees included in the progeny test were sample trees of the natural stand; they were pollinated mostly by neighboring trees. Results of progeny test confirmed the essential uniformity of progeny parents, including the seed parents and pollen parents, within each natural stand. For the purpose of early production of superior seed, crosses can be readily collected from the superior stands and from other trees of the superior stands for immediate use in bushel quantities.

The results further indicated that parent trees with desirable characters were concentrated in certain stands and possibly in the general areas where the superior stands were located. For the second generation seed orchard, additional sample trees from the superior stands and from additional phenotypically desirable stands in their vicinity were included in the test materials for further evaluation and selection.

#### LITERATURE CITED

- Barber, J.C. 1966. Variation among half-sib families from three loblolly pine stands in Georgia. Ga. Forest Res. Council. Res. Pap. 37. 5pp.
- LaFarge, T. 1974. Genetic variation among and within three loblolly pine stands in Georgia. Forest Science 20: 272-275.
- Wang, C.W. 1967. The genetic improvement of ponderosa pine in Idaho. University of Idaho, Forest, Wildlife and Range Exp. Sta., Sta. Note No. 7. 8 pp.
- Wang, C.W. and R.K. Patee. 1974. Variation in seed characteristics, and seedling growth of open pollinated ponderosa pine progenies. University of Idaho, Forest, Wildlife and Range Exp. Sta., Sta. Pap. No. 15. 12pp.
- Wells, O.O. and Switzer. 1971. Variation in rust resistance in Mississippi loblolly pine. 11th South. Conf. Forest Tree Improv. Proc. 1971:25-30.

## APPENDIX I

Stand	Tree	Alt.	Soil	Lat. N.	Land	RD	County	T	R	S	Note
(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)	(10)	(11)	(12)
1	10	5000	B	44:33	P	Council	Adams	14N	2E	16	Anderson
2	10	4500	B	44:26	P	Council	Adams	13N	2E	13,23	Mill Creek
5	7	6000	G	44:36	B	Cascade	Valley	15N	7E	30	Camp Creek
8	10	4800	G	44:32	B	Cascade	Valley	14N	4E	21	Crawford
9	10	5000	G	43:51	B	Idaho City	Boise	6N	5E	20	Warm Springs
11	10	6000	G	43:36	B	Mt. Home	Elmore	3N	9E	4,9	Lester Cr.
14	10	5200	B	44:21	B	Emmett	Gen	12N	2E	33	Sagehen
15	10	4100	B	44:24	B	Emmett	Gen	12N	1E	14	Third Fork
16	6	5800	G	44:47	P	McCall	Valley	17N	5E	20	Powellson Cr.
17	(a)	4200	G	45:03	P	New Meadows	Adams	20N	2E	19	
18	6	6000	G	43:55	B	Lowman	Boise	7N	8E	14	Bear Creek
19	10	4800	G	43:46	State	Idaho City	Boise	5N	6E		
20A	8	4200	G	43:46	State	Idaho City	Boise	6N	6E		
20B	8	4200	G	43:52	State	Idaho City	Boise	6N	5E		
21A	7	3500	B	45:09	BLM	Higgins	Idaho	21N	1E	1	Hazard Creek
21B	3	4300	G	44:09	BLM	Crouch	Boise	10N	4E	29	Scraper Creek
22	4	4000	G	44:05	B	Lowman	Boise	9N	8E	33	S. Fk. Payette
23	5	4100	B	44:40	P	Weiser	Valley	15N	4W	6	Mill Creek
24	7	3800	B	44:41	P	Weiser	Valley	16N	4W	20	Pine Creek
25	10	6400	G	43:49	B	Idaho City	Boise	5N	6E	3	Rabbit Creek
26	5	5000	B	44:36	BC	Weiser	Adams	15N	2E	17	Mica Creek
27	4	4500	B	44:38	BC	Weiser	Adams	15N	2E	7	Cabin Creek
28	10	5000	B	45:03	P	New Meadows	Adams	20N	1E	19	Mud Creek
29	9	3200	B	44:53	P	New Meadows	Adams	18N	1W	8	Ralph Creek
35	9	5000	G	43:48	B	Boise	Elmore	6N	9E		Dutch Creek
38	9	4000	G	45:03	P	New Meadows	Adams	20N	2E	19	Circle C
39	4	4000	B	44:49	P	New Meadows	Adams	19N	2E	16	3-Mile Creek
41	8	6500	G	43:44	B	Boise	Elmore	5N	8E	25	Dutch Creek
42	6	3900	G	43:37	B	Boise	Elmore	3N	6E	9	Trail Creek
43A	9	4700	B	45:47	State	WhiteBird	Idaho	28N	1W	12	Rice Creek
43B	8	4300	G	44:03	State	Horaeophos	Boise	8N	3E	16	Fleming Creek
46	10	4480	G	44:18	B	Emmett	Boise	11N	5E	4,5	West Fork Rd.
47	8	3600	G	44:04	B	Emmett	Boise	8N	4E	1	Garden Valley
50	5	4300	G	43:37	S	Shak Creek	Elmore	3N	11E	13,18	Baumgartner
51	1	4300	G	43:37	S	Shak Creek	Elmore	3N	10E	11	Barker Gulch
53	6	4000	G	44:52	P	Krassel	Valley	18N	6E	15	Camp Creek
54	8	5000	G	45:05	P	Krassel	Valley	20N	6E	21	Zena Creek

### Geographic Sources of the Progeny Test Parent Trees

Column: (1) stand number, (2) parent trees, (3) altitude, ft., (4) soil types: B-basaltic, G-Granitic, (5) approximate latitude, (6) Land: B-Boise National Forest, BC-Boise Cascade Corp., BLM-Bureau of Land Management, P-Payette National Forest, S-Sawtooth National Forest, State-Idaho State Department of Public Lands, (7) RD: Ranger District of National Forest or location, (8) County, (9) Township, (10) Range, (11) Section, (12) note, (a) stand 17 seed source is bulked seed from Circle C seed production area adjacent to stand 38.









UNIVERSITY OF IDAHO LIBRARY

WANG, Chi-Wu and PATEE, Robert K. (1976)  
Regional Variation of Ponderosa Pine, the 5-Year Result  
Univ. Idaho Forest, Wildl. & Range Exp. Sta.  
Bull. 10. 8 pp.

Progeny tests at four sites showed that the among-stand and among-progeny 5-year height differences were highly significant. There was no significant difference among substands. In two of the test sites, 48.65 to 58.19 percent of the total variance was attributable to variation among stands, and 19.51 to 25.20 percent of the total variance was attributable to half-sib families within substands.

The 5-year progeny height was significantly correlated with 1-year seedling height and inversely correlated with age and altitude of mother tree, but not correlated with seed characteristics including seed weight, seed size, and germination capacity.

**KEY WORDS:** Progeny test, Seed Orchard, Seed, *Pinus ponderosa*  
Oxford Number 165.3

#### ABSTRACT

WANG, Chi-Wu and PATEE, Robert K. (1976)  
Regional Variation of Ponderosa Pine, the 5-Year Result  
Univ. Idaho Forest, Wildl. & Range Exp. Sta.  
Bull. 10. 8 pp.

Progeny tests at four sites showed that the among-stand and among-progeny 5-year height differences were highly significant. There was no significant difference among substands. In two of the test sites, 48.65 to 58.19 percent of the total variance was attributable to variation among stands, and 19.51 to 25.20 percent of the total variance was attributable to half-sib families within substands.

The 5-year progeny height was significantly correlated with 1-year seedling height and inversely correlated with age and altitude of mother tree, but not correlated with seed characteristics including seed weight, seed size, and germination capacity.

**KEY WORDS:** Progeny test, Seed Orchard, Seed, *Pinus ponderosa*  
Oxford Number 165.3

WANG, Chi-Wu and PATEE, Robert K. (1976)  
Regional Variation of Ponderosa Pine, the 5-Year Result  
Univ. Idaho Forest, Wildl. & Range Exp. Sta.  
Bull. 10. 8 pp.

Progeny tests at four sites showed that the among-stand and among-progeny 5-year height differences were highly significant. There was no significant difference among substands. In two of the test sites, 48.65 to 58.19 percent of the total variance was attributable to variation among stands, and 19.51 to 25.20 percent of the total variance was attributable to half-sib families within substands.

The 5-year progeny height was significantly correlated with 1-year seedling height and inversely correlated with age and altitude of mother tree, but not correlated with seed characteristics including seed weight, seed size, and germination capacity.

**KEY WORDS:** Progeny test, Seed Orchard, Seed, *Pinus ponderosa*  
Oxford Number 165.3

#### ABSTRACT

WANG, Chi-Wu and PATEE, Robert K. (1976)  
Regional Variation of Ponderosa Pine, the 5-Year Result  
Univ. Idaho Forest, Wildl. & Range Exp. Sta.  
Bull. 10. 8 pp.

Progeny tests at four sites showed that the among-stand and among-progeny 5-year height differences were highly significant. There was no significant difference among substands. In two of the test sites, 48.65 to 58.19 percent of the total variance was attributable to variation among stands, and 19.51 to 25.20 percent of the total variance was attributable to half-sib families within substands.

The 5-year progeny height was significantly correlated with 1-year seedling height and inversely correlated with age and altitude of mother tree, but not correlated with seed characteristics including seed weight, seed size, and germination capacity.

**KEY WORDS:** Progeny test, Seed Orchard, Seed, *Pinus ponderosa*  
Oxford Number 165.3

